

INTERNATIONAL SYMPOSIUM
Understanding Bach's B-minor Mass

Discussion Book

Volume I

Full Papers by the Speakers at the Symposium
on 2, 3 and 4 November 2007

Edited by Yo Tomita, Elise Crean and Ian Mills

School of Music & Sonic Arts

Queen's University Belfast
September 2007

School of Music & Sonic Arts

Queen's University Belfast
Belfast, BT7 1NN
Northern Ireland
<http://www.music.qub.ac.uk>

Cover Design by Andrew Norton
Media Services, Queen's University Belfast

No part of this book may be reproduced without permission from the organising committee.

Organising Committee

Anne Leahy (DIT Conservatory of Music and Drama, Dublin)
Robin A. Leaver (Westminster Choir College, NJ, USA)
Sarah McCleave (Queen's University Belfast)
Jan Smaczny (Queen's University Belfast)
Yo Tomita (Queen's University Belfast)
Ian Woodfield (Queen's University Belfast)

Contents

Book One

CONTENTS	iii
EDITORIAL PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	ix
Cultural Transfer, Cultural Competition, and Religious Diversity in Leipzig during the Baroque Era <i>Tanya Kevorkian (Millersville University, USA)</i>	1
Placing the ‘Et incarnatus’ and ‘Crucifixus’ in Context: Bach and the Panorama of the Baroque Mass Tradition <i>Jasmin Cameron (Aberdeen University, UK)</i>	11
How Relevant is Count Jan Adam von Questenberg for the Genesis of the B-minor Mass? A Preliminary Report <i>Michael Maul (Bach-Archiv Leipzig, Germany)</i>	27
On the Role and Meaning of the Polonaise in the Mass in B minor by Johann Sebastian Bach as Exemplified by the Aria ‘Quoniam tu solus sanctus’ <i>Szymon Paczkowski (University of Warsaw, Poland)</i>	33
Consideration of Bach’s <i>Kyrie e Gloria</i> BWV 232 ¹ within the Context of Dresden Catholic Mass Settings, 1729–1733 <i>Janice B. Stockigt (University of Melbourne, Australia)</i>	52
Chiastic Reflection in the B-minor Mass: Lament’s Paradoxical Mirror <i>Melvin P. Unger (Baldwin-Wallace College, USA)</i>	93
The <i>Symbolum Nicenum</i> of the B-minor Mass and Bach’s Late Choral Ideal <i>George B. Stauffer (Rutgers University, USA)</i>	116
Parallel Proportions, Final Revisions and the Status of Manuscript P 180 <i>Ruth Tatlow (Stockholm University, Sweden)</i>	118
Some Observations on the Formal Design of Bach’s B-minor Mass <i>Ulrich Siegele (University of Tübingen, Germany)</i>	137
Bach’s Calov Bible and his Quest for the Title of Royal Court Composer <i>Mary Dalton Greer (Cambridge, MA, USA)</i>	150

How ‘Catholic’ is Bach’s ‘Lutheran’ Mass? <i>Robin A. Leaver (Westminster Choir College of Rider University, USA)</i>	177
Manuscript score No. 4500 in St. Petersburg: A new source of the B-minor Mass <i>Tatiana Shabalina (St. Petersburg State Conservatoire «Rimsky-Korsakov», Russia)</i>	207
Many problems, different solutions: Editing Bach’s Mass in B minor <i>Uwe Wolf (Bach-Archiv Leipzig, Germany)</i>	226
J.S. Bach’s Mass in B minor: Observations and Hypotheses with regard to some Original Sources <i>Hans-Joachim Schulze (Bach-Archiv Leipzig, Germany)</i>	234
Performing Bach’s B-minor Mass: Some Notes by Heinrich Schenker <i>Jan-Piet Knijff (Queens College and Purchase College, USA)</i>	239
Intensity, Complexity and Musical Rhetoric in Performances of the B-minor Mass <i>Uri Golomb (Tel Aviv, Israel)</i>	258
Viennese Traditions of the Mass in B Minor <i>Ulrich Leisinger (Internationale Stiftung Mozarteum Salzburg, Austria)</i>	278
A ‘fairly correct copy of the mass’? Mendelssohn’s score of the B-minor Mass as a document of the Romantics’ view on matters of performance practice and source criticism <i>Anselm Hartinger (Schola Cantorum Basiliensis, Switzerland)</i>	286
The Mass in B Minor in Nineteenth-Century England <i>Katharine Pardee (Oxford University, UK)</i>	292
Reception History of the Mass in B minor in Russia <i>Tatiana Shabalina (St. Petersburg State Conservatoire «Rimsky-Korsakov», Russia)</i>	309
Theodore Thomas’s 1902 Performance of Bach’s Mass in B Minor: Working within the Grand American Festival <i>Paul Luongo (Florida State University, USA)</i>	322
The B-minor Mass and Japanese People: A Problematical Issue of ‘Universality’ <i>Tadashi Ioyama (Kunitachi College of Music, Japan)</i>	344
Bach’s B-minor Mass: An Incarnation in Prague in the 1860s and its Consequences <i>Jan Smaczny (Queen’s University Belfast, UK)</i>	352

Book Two

- ‘Et Incarnatus’ and ‘Crucifixus’:
The Earliest and Latest Settings of Bach’s B-minor Mass 357
Christoph Wolff (Harvard University, USA)
Edited reprint of article originally published in: *Eighteenth-Century Music in Theory and Practice: Essays in Honor of Alfred Mann*, ed. Mary Anne Parker (Stuyvesant: Pendragon Press, 1994), 1–17, with author’s postscript
- Bach’s Use of Fugue in the *Stile Antico* Vocal Writing
of the B-Minor Mass 368
Paul Walker (University of Virginia, USA)
Unpublished and expanded paper read at the Biennial Meeting of the American Bach Society, Leipzig, May 11–13, 2006: ‘Bach Crossing Borders’
- Universality in Bach’s B Minor Mass:
A Portrait of Bach in His Final Years 387
Yoshitake Kobayashi (Seijo University, Japan)
New translation of ‘Die Universalität in Bachs h-Moll-Messe. Ein Beitrag zum Bach-Bild der letzten Lebensjahre’, *Musik und Kirche* lviii/1 (1987), 9–24
- Friedrich Smend’s Edition of the B-minor Mass by J. S. Bach 404
Georg von Dadelsen
Edited reprint of article published in *Bach* xx/2 (1989), 49–74
- Dogma set to music: Theological aspects of Bach’s B-minor Mass 425
Martin Petzoldt (Leipzig University, Germany)
English translation of ‘Vertonte Dogmatik. Zu theologischen Aspekten der h-Moll-Messe Bachs’, in: *Bach für Kenner und Liebhaber: Festschrift zum 70. Geburtstag von Diethard Hellmann* (Stuttgart: Carus Verlag, 1998), 67–75
- Numerical Ordering in Bach’s B-minor Mass 435
Ruth Tatlow (Stockholm University, Sweden)
Unpublished and revised paper given at the colloquium ‘Bach’s B Minor Mass: Perspectives on its music and history’ in Oxford on 19 December 2000, with author’s postscript
- A Guide to the Temporal Structure of the 1733 *Missa* 446
Don O. Franklin (University of Pittsburgh, USA)
A new article based on his paper given at the Wissenschaftliche Konferenz ‘Bach in Leipzig / Bach und Leipzig’ from 27 to 29 January 2000
- J. S. Bach’s Mass in B minor: A Study of its Reception History
in the First Half of the Nineteenth Century especially regarding
the Activities of Felix Mendelssohn Bartholdy 459
Hiromi Hoshino (Rikkyo University, Japan)
English translation of ‘J. S. Bach saku “Misa Kyoku Ro Tanchō” no 19seiki Zenhan ni okeru Juyō. Ensō Kiroku no Kenshō o tōshite’, in *Senzoku-Ronsō (Memoirs by the members of Senzoku-Gakuen College)* xxiv (1995), 145–159, with revised conclusion

The Coates Continuo Conundrum Clarified <i>Teri Noel Towe (New Jersey, USA)</i>	474
A new article accompanying his poster at Exhibition Room (at which his recorded lecture is also available)	
B-minor Mass: Select Bibliography	492
INDEX OF WORKS	505
INDEX OF NAMES	507

Editorial Preface

These two volumes contain the material for participants to read before attending the International Symposium ‘Understanding Bach’s B-minor Mass’ which we are hosting at Queen’s University Belfast from the 2nd to 4th November 2007.

Book One contains the written forms of the areas to be covered by the presentations, which will be expanded and illustrated by each speaker at the symposium. Participants are therefore requested to read these contributions carefully so that there can be active and effective discussions during the symposium. Even with a brief inspection, one will find in this book an astonishing breadth and depth of discussions attesting that Bach’s B-minor Mass continues to stimulate scholarly research. Obviously, some speakers wish us to be fully informed of the content of their presentations in November, while others are still carrying out their research up to the moment of their arrival in Belfast. Among these are the fresh investigations on sources undertaken by the researchers at the Bach-Archiv Leipzig: Michael Maul (who is currently working in the archives in Brno and Prague, digging deep into hitherto unknown materials about Questenberg and Sporck) and Uwe Wolf (who is examining in Berlin the frail autograph score of the B-minor Mass using high-tech equipment to conduct micro X-Ray fluorescence analysis, hoping that we may be able to separate the complex layers of corrections entered by Bach as well as the successive owners of his score). Let us hope, that in a month they will be able to report significant discoveries in their pursuits that may influence the directions of our own work.

Book Two is somewhat different: it is a ‘resource book’ consisting of (a) the reprint of those articles published some time ago which, in the organising committee’s view, are so vitally important that everyone must re-read them before gathering in Belfast, (b) those unpublished papers on the B-minor Mass that were read at recent conferences, and (c) a select bibliography of the scholarly discussions of the B-minor Mass.

The organising committee feel that although it is quite a task to read through this 500-page document between the time when it reaches the participants in various parts of the world (hopefully in early October) and their actual arrival in Belfast, it is both important and necessary to peruse it in order to ensure that we can have truly meaningful discussions in November.

As the Chair of the organising committee, I wish to express my gratitude to those people who have been helping me in preparing this document. Firstly, the two external, international committee members: Robin A. Leaver (USA) and Anne Leahy (Ireland)—not only for their original idea to have this event in Belfast, but also for their unflinching support and enthusiasm. Robin has been extremely generous with both time and ideas to steer this project at every moment when I encountered problems. It is him who obtained Martin Pezoldt’s important article for Discussion Book Two, and helped us to polish this piece. Anne has been the locomotive for the venture, but to our great

sadness, she has lately become seriously ill. We sincerely hope that she will be well in time to grill the speakers of the Theology session as a respondent. Secondly, my thanks go to all the contributors of these volumes; without their cooperation and enthusiasm to produce these fine contributions in such a short space of time, we would not have had such an impressive collection of papers to make up these thick and dense volumes. But, my heart goes to my students, Elise Crean and Ian Mills, who worked virtually day and night in the last two weeks on editing the papers for Discussion Book One (as some of you may know that not every paper arrived on time!), and Tanja Kovačević for undertaking the colossal task of compiling the Select Bibliography and polishing all the papers in Discussion Book Two to such a high standard. My heartfelt thanks also goes to Andrew Koll and Isabella van Elferen who undertook the difficult task of translating the article by Martin Petzoldt, who is unable to join us due to his university duties at the time but is present in spirit and is deputized by his paper. Finally, but not least importantly, I would like to thank all my colleagues at Queen's: without their support and encouragement, it would not have been possible to put these volumes together within such a short space of time.

Yo Tomita
20 September 2007

Acknowledgements

We acknowledge with thanks the following individuals and institutions for their permission to reproduce some of the materials included in the Discussion Books: Professor Aleksandr V. Tchaikovskij, the director of the St. Petersburg Conservatoire, for allowing us to use the images of the manuscript in their library; Professor Christoph Wolff, Professor Yoshitake Kobayashi, Professor Martin Petzoldt and Professor Hiromi Hoshino for allowing us to reprint their articles; Professor Paul Walker, Dr Ruth Tatlow, Professor Don Franklin and Dr Teri Noel Towe for allowing us to print their unpublished papers; and the Riemenschneider Bach Institute, Berea, Ohio, and its director Professor Melvin Unger for allowing us to reuse the translation of the article by the late Professor Georg von Dadelsen.

Abbreviations

- ARSI Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu Fondo Vecchia Compagnia; Provinciae Bohemiae (Boh)
- Bach* *Bach*. The Journal of the Riemenschneider Bach Institute, Berea, Ohio (1970–)
- BC *Bach Compendium: Analytisch-bibliographisches Repertorium der Werke Johann Sebastian Bachs*, eds. Hans-Joachim Schulze and Christoph Wolff (Leipzig: Peters, 1985–)
- BDok *Bach Dokumente* (1963–)
- i *Schriftstücke von der Hand Johann Sebastian Bachs*, eds. Werner Neumann and Hans-Joachim Schulze (Leipzig and Kassel: VEB Deutscher Verlag für Musik, 1963)
- ii *Fremdschriftliche und gedruckte Dokumente zur Lebensgeschichte Johann Sebastian Bachs 1685–1750*, eds. Werner Neumann and Hans-Joachim Schulze (Leipzig and Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1969)
- iii *Dokumente zum Nachwirken Johann Sebastian Bachs 1750–1800*, ed. Hans-Joachim Schulze (Leipzig and Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1972)
- BJ *Bach-Jahrbuch* (1904–)
- Butt MBM John Butt, *Bach: Mass in B Minor* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991)
- BWV *Bach-Werke-Verzeichnis*. Kleine Ausgabe (BWV^{2a}) nach der von Wolfgang Schmider vorgelegten 2. Ausgabe, eds. Alfred Dürr and Yoshitake Kobayashi (Wiesbaden and Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1998)
- Hkm Wolfgang Horn, *Die Dresdner Hofkirchenmusik 1720–1745. Studien zu ihren Voraussetzungen und ihrem Repertoire*. (Kassel: Bärenreiter; Stuttgart: Carus-Verlag, 1987)
- IMS *Irish Musical Studies* (1990–)
- viii *Bach Studies from Dublin: Selected papers presented at the ninth biennial conference on Baroque music, held at Trinity College Dublin from 12th to 16th July 2000*, eds. Anne Leahy and Yo Tomita (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2004)
- KB Kritischer Bericht [critical report of NBA]
- LW *Luther's Works: American edition*, eds. Jaroslav Pelikan and Helmut Lehman (St Louis and Philadelphia: Concordia and Fortress, 1955–)
- MGG *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart. Allgemeine Enzyklopädie der Musik* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1949–)

- MKirche *Musik und Kirche* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1929–)
- MQ *The Musical Quarterly* (1915–)
- NBA *Johann Sebastian Bach. Neue Ausgabe Sämtlicher Werke*, eds. Johann-Sebastian-Bach-Institut Göttingen and Bach-Archiv Leipzig (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1954–)
- NBR *The New Bach Reader. A Life of Johann Sebastian Bach in Letters and Documents*, eds. Hans T. David and Arthur Mendel, revised and enlarged by Christoph Wolff (New York: Norton, 1998)
- NG *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, ed. Stanley Sadie (London: Macmillan, 1980)
- NG II *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Second edition*, eds. Stanley Sadie and John Tyrrell (London: Macmillan, 2001)
- RV Peter Ryom, *Répertoire des œuvres d'Antonio Vivaldi*. (Copenhagen: Engstrøm & Sødring A.S. Musikforlag, 1986)
- SBB Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin Preussischer Kulturbesitz
- SLB Sächsische Landesbibliothek (from 1917; formerly 'Königliche Landesbibliothek')
- SLUB Sächsische Landesbibliothek – Staats- und Universitätsbibliothek Dresden (from 1996)
- Stauffer *Bach: The Mass in B Minor ('The Great Catholic Mass')* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1997; New Haven; London: Yale University Press, 2003)
- WA *Luthers Werke: Kritische Gesamtausgabe*, eds. J.F.K. Knaake et al (Weimar: Böhlau, 1883–)
- WTC Well-tempered Clavier
- ZD Wolfgang Horn, Thomas Kohlhase, Ortrun Landman, Wolfgang Reich, eds. *Zelenka-Dokumentation. Quellen und Materialien*, 2 vols. (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf, 1989)
- ZS *Zelenka-Studien*
- i *Die Referate der Internationalen Fachkonferenz J. D. Zelenka, Marburg, J.-G.-Herder-Institut, 16.-20. November 1991*, ed. Th. Kohlhase with Hubert Unverricht. Musik des Ostens xiv. (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1993)
- ii *Referate und Materialien der 2. Internationalen Fachkonferenz Jan Dismas Zelenka*, ed. Günter Gattermann zusammengestellt und redigiert von Wolfgang Reich. Deutsche Musik im Osten xii. (Sankt Augustin, 1997)
- ZWV Wolfgang Reich, *Jan Dismas Zelenka. Thematisch-systematisches Verzeichnis der musikalischen Werke* (ZWV) (Dresden: Sächsische Landesbibliothek, 1985)